

16<sup>th</sup> September 2011

The Director General  
NSW Department of Planning  
GPO Box 39  
SYDNEY NSW 2001

Attention: Ms Kim Shaw

Dear Sir,

**RE: SCOTTISH HOSPITAL, 2 COOPER STREET PADDINGTON NSW 2021  
MP10\_0016 – APPLICATION FOR SENIORS HOUSING AND CARE FACILITY**

We write in response to the written comments by The National Trust of Australia (New South Wales), dated 9 December 2010, in relation to heritage matters. NBRS+Partners prepared the Statement of Heritage Impact submitted as part of the Environmental Assessment for this project.

The site is listed as having heritage significance at the local level. Proposed development and changes to the existing setting of the Scottish Hospital building have been informed by the following specialist documents:

- Aspect Studios, September 2010. *Landscape Architects Design Statement for the Scottish Hospital*. Unpublished report prepared for The Presbyterian Church (NSW) Property Trust.
- Casey & Lowe Associates. September 2010. *Assessment of Archaeological Impact*. Unpublished report prepared for The Presbyterian Church (NSW) Property Trust.
- MUSEcape Pty Ltd, edited by Mr Chris Betteridge, August 2000 revised 2010. *Scottish Hospital: Landscape Assessment Report*. Unpublished report prepared for The Presbyterian Church (NSW) Property Trust.
- NBRS+Partners (September 2010). *Conservation Plan: The Scottish Hospital, 2 Cooper Street Paddington NSW 2021*. Unpublished report prepared for The Presbyterian Church (NSW) Property Trust.
- Tree Wise Men Australia Pty Ltd, November 2009. *Preliminary advice: Redevelopment of Scottish Hospital site Paddington*. Unpublished report prepared for The Presbyterian Church (NSW) Property Trust.

The National Trust of Australia raised eleven points highlighting four key heritage issues relating to:

- Removal of trees and garden terraces.
- Loss of views within and through the site.
- Visual impact of the scale of the proposed development within the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area.
- Adaptation of the heritage-listed former residence.

We submit our response to the eleven comments outlined by the National Trust as follows:

***Issue 1: Issues arising from the removal of trees and garden terraces.***

The existing setting of The Scottish Hospital was assessed as part of the submission. The assessment considered the heritage significance of trees and plantings and their contribution to the cultural setting of the Hospital.

One heritage-listed tree would be removed as part of the application as it is in poor condition and has previously been approved for removal by Woollahra Council as it poses a potential risk to visitors to the site and to pedestrians generally in Brown Street. Other trees would be replaced to enhance both the setting of the new development and the streets immediately surrounding the site. Plantings would be located to balance views glimpses into and through the site while

P:\OBS\10\10336\WBRS\_response NatTrust\_NSW.doc

Page 1 of 3

Level 3, 4 Glen Street, Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia

T: 61 2 9922 2344 F: 61 2 9922 1308 E: architects@nbrsap.com.au W: www.nbrsap.com.au

DIRECTORS Ridley Smith reg. No 2268 + Graham Thorburn reg. No 5706 + Robert Staas + Geoffrey Deane reg. No 3766 + Garry Hoddinnett reg. No 5286 + Andrew Duffin reg. No 5602

GENERAL MANAGER Graham Nicholas SENIOR ASSOCIATES John Baker + Barry Flack + Vicki Van Dijk ASSOCIATES Jon West + Rod Drayton + Trevor Eveleigh

NOEL BELL RIDLEY SMITH & PARTNERS PTY LIMITED ABN 16 002 247565

providing a degree of privacy for residents within the site of The Scottish Hospital.

The strategy adopted for the current proposal is to retain surviving mature trees, particularly those:

- Associated with Henry Burton Bradley, who was responsible for the construction of the garden terraces and plantings undertaken between 1850 and 1873;
- Associated with the early hospital, later known as The Scottish Hospital, particularly the period from 1900 to 1926; and
- Trees with a significant canopy would be maintained to enhance in views to the site.

Where trees are to be removed, they would be replaced with new trees and under-planting to reinforce the garden setting, particularly in views into the site from the surrounding streets. Cabbage palms would be planted in gardens adjacent to Cooper Street to enhance the streetscape.

The surviving section of terraced garden is generally in a deteriorated condition, and cannot be used by residents in its current configuration as it is too steep to provide pedestrian access. Documentary evidence indicates the terraces have been progressively compromised by the replacement of garden areas with grass and new shrubs. The remnant steps have been dislodged by tree roots and would need to be rebuilt to comply with BCA requirements.

The surviving section of terraced garden has been assessed as having heritage significance at the local level. A plan dating from 1889 indicates they were created as a 'terraced garden' for Henry Burton Bradley. No evidence to date suggests the terraces were specifically designed for growing grapes, and historical evidence suggests the site was unused until the 1850s.

The partial removal and adaptation of the remnant terraced garden has previously been approved by Woollahra Municipal Council (DA No.931/2001).

***Issue 2: Issues arising from the loss of views within and through the site.***

The Scottish Hospital site has been in private ownership since the land was granted in 1833.

The proposed development has taken into consideration the existing views of residents from immediately surrounding area together with the requirement for privacy of the residents of the Scottish Hospital site. This has been in part addressed by replacing the existing perimeter fence with a palisade fence to permit views to garden areas located adjacent to Brown Street and the northern section of the site.

New buildings would generally replace existing non-heritage buildings and would be set back from Brown Street and Stephens Street to permit views into some garden areas. The new buildings would be situated to allow glimpses into other sections of the site while maintaining privacy for residents within the site.

East-west views through the lower section of the site, and looking south from Dillon Park will be retained and enhanced by new planting.

***Issue 3: Issues arising from the visual impact of the scale of the proposed development within the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area.***

The site is zoned as Special Hospital Uses, reflecting its use as a private hospital since 1901 and later as aged care facilities for the Presbyterian Church in Australia.

The scheme has been developed with consideration of the existing view corridors and vistas in the streets immediately surrounding the site of The Scottish Hospital. New buildings have been designed to minimise the foot print of the buildings and to provide open areas within the site. They would be set back from the street boundaries and takes advantage of the natural slope of the site to minimise the impact of the scale of the new development on the Paddington Heritage conservation Area generally.

The scheme would not adversely impact on the significant views and vistas identified in the

**Issue 4: Issues arising from the adaptation of the heritage-listed former residence.**

The proposed changes to the former hospital building have been developed with consideration of the Conservation Management Plan (CMP) prepared by NBRSPartners (2010). The structure of the CMP is in keeping with the recommendations of the NSW Heritage Branch, the Burra Charter and *The Conservation Management Plan* by JS Kerr. The Scottish Hospital building has been adapted with regard to the relative significance of spaces and components identified in the CMP, to minimise adverse impacts on the heritage significance of the place.

The original residence, The Terraces, was irreversibly altered in c1900 and 1926 when the building was adapted as a hospital. Those changes included the replacement of the roof and stucco finish to the external walls to change the architectural character of the building to an Arts and Craft style. Further changes were undertaken from the 1970s through to the mid 1990s.

The proposed adaptation of The Scottish Hospital building is acceptable in heritage terms as they would:

- a) Assist in the recovery of significant spaces at ground floor and first floor levels;
- b) Involve the retention of surviving sections/components of the original nineteenth century house including remnant joinery;
- c) Not involve the removal of original heritage fabric, and are designed to have minimal visual impact on views to the site;
- d) Assist Presbyterian Aged Care to continue its long association with the site, and to provide relevant aged care facilities for the projected needs of the Municipality.

In our opinion the proposed scheme has balanced the Owners requirements, the statutory building requirements and the heritage requirements to enable Presbyterian Aged Care to continue to provide facilities within the Woollahra Municipality. NBRSPartners therefore has no hesitation in recommending this application for approval.

Yours faithfully,

**NBRSPARTNERS**



for  
Robert Staas  
Director/Heritage Consultant